The Use of Indirect Sexism
to Show Men’s Ambivalent Opinion about Women
in Esquire Indonesia’s Women We Love

Tri Anissah Arfiani
Gesang Manggala Nugraha Putra
English Department, Universitas Airlangga

Abstract

This study tries to find out on how men see women in this modern days. Is it the same as in the past where men always see women as weak character, men’s object, and do not have any authority toward everything, or the opposite, or perhaps men could see women in both ways? This study chooses Esquire Magazine Indonesia column “Women We Love” in three editions (August and December 2015 and February 2016) as the objects, because this column could determine how modern men see women nowadays especially in Indonesia. This study uses Critical Discourse Analysis as method and Sara Mills’ notion about sexism. In result, these methods and theories find out that Esquire Magazine has an ambivalent opinion toward women. The magazine seems to agree that women could be superior to men and they keep praising how successful the women that they discussed. Nevertheless, behind those praises, this magazine still stereotypically see women as men’s object. In other words, men in the magazine are unable to accept the notion that women could be superior to men.

Keywords: ambivalent, critical discourse analysis, indirect sexism, magazine

1. Introduction

In these modern days the way people, especially men, treat women is different from how they treat woman a long time ago. Long time ago men say and treat women as a group that is inferior to them, the one who has no power, weak, irrational, and submissive; that is why they always exclude women in making any decision or not giving them any special position in a job which is called Traditional gender roles (Tyson, 2006, p. 85). But nowadays women are treated better; people come to appreciate what women do which one of the appreciations is by praising them about what they do especially about their career. People come to accept that women could work in a higher position or do something that they want instead of just staying at home. All of these happen because of the struggle of women who fight with the discrimination society give to them; as Mills said that ‘… because of the impact of feminism and the changes which have come in the wake of women’s integration into the workforce’ (Tyson, 2006, p. 20).

However, it does not make women completely accepted to be in the same position as men. Feminists do not stop prove that there are still some attitudes directed to women in order to downgrade women’s position in society. One of the attitudes given is by giving a subtle sexist utterance or what Sara Mills called as indirect sexism.

According to Glick and Fiske sexism tend to be seen by society as “… a reflection of hostility toward women.” (Fiske, 1996). The hostility may be given by giving statements or utterances which could downgrade women’s position in society. A statement could be considered as sexist if it consists of stereotypical idea about women like women should stay at home and do housework, then when it indicates that men are the center of everything, also when it could be considered as a presupposition that what women do is trivial or not as important as what men do (Mills, 2008, p. 2).

The statement may be delivered in a direct or indirect way. In the case of indirect sexism, it is difficult to define it because it is delivered through humor or by giving praises which resulted on how people respond to it as Sunderland said that “…others will recognize it for what it is, resist it, laugh at it and/or
become empowered in the process’ (Mills, 2008, p. 14). That is why indirect sexism is one of the difficult obstacles that feminist face nowadays.

Despite the difficulty the researcher still choose this as the main issue that the society needs to focus on. By giving an example through this research, the researcher expects that society, especially women, could have new knowledge about the subtle way society give in order to downgrade women even though it seems they already accept women’s position in society.

The example that will be given in this research is by analyzing one of the columns in men’s magazine Esquire Indonesia titled Women We Love. Esquire Indonesia magazine is one of the branches from Esquire America which was founded in 1933. Its target is men in 25-45 years old who are open-minded and sophisticated men which the researcher believes could represent modern men. Though it is a men’s magazine, it does not focus on how men should work their body in order to be muscular and healthy men, it also talks on how men should be successful and fashionable by giving tips or advice. Also, they have columns that talk about recent issues happening in Indonesia or worldwide so that men have more common knowledge. But then because it is a men’s magazine it can be helped that there is a column that talks about women, and its title is Women We Love.

This column depicts successful women who are generally successful in doing what they want, especially women in the entertainment world. Here they talk about how the women achieve their successful career and they also give them support to keep pursuing their career. As the title says, this column is made so that men have this guidance when choosing their women; they should love women who could do what they want and succeed on it also not to mention the women should be beautiful. So that when they show their women to their business colleges they will not feel embarrassed.

However, this research argues that though this column seems to support women in doing what women want to do and support them. There are still some parts which lead men to downgrade women’s position mentioned in this column. The way they downgrade women is by delivering it through indirect sexism in their use of language. And this becomes the concern of this study.

In order to know how language is used in this column can be considered as sexist or not, the researcher chooses Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) proposed by Sara Mills to unveil how women is portrayed in this column by seeing the position of Subject-object and readers. And to expose the language use, the researcher uses Indirect sexism which also proposed by Sara Mills in her book Sexism and Language in 2008.

There are several journals which talk focuses on sexism as their main issue. First, there is by Frederick Thomas Attenborough; this article took the football incident news in England involving two famous people: Andy Gray, a former soccer player and Richard Keys a famous television and radio presenter, who got caught giving sexist comment to one of woman staff near them (Attenborough). Since the video of them got spread, there are many comments of them being sexist; but media covered this news as if their sexist comment is not significant. Instead according to the Attenborough, media make the one who complains about their sexist comment as someone who actually mock themselves and their own reputation. And the second journal with “Playing the gender card’’: Media representations of Julia Gillard’s sexism and misogyny speech as the title talks about the moment when first-female Australia’s prime minister Julia Gillard accuses her opponent Tony Abort of sexism and misogyny. It focuses on how media cover her accusing, and Anna Worth and Brianne Hastie prove that what Julia Gillard do in confronting sexism does not give her any advantage; instead because of media coverage, her position is underestimated and got negative effect about her identity.

Besides those two journals, there is one article that used CDA as its methodology to unveil how women are represented in a children narrative story in Spain. Taking (Maestre) as its title Maria D Lopez Maestre found that by telling children a story which depicted woman as arrogant, boastful about her beauty, and too picky in choosing her life partner could naturalize the notion that sexism attitude to women is acceptable.

From the three journals, we could see that society accept sexism attitude toward women and it cannot be helped since society already give knowledge about what women should be since childhood as in the
last journal. And even if women have the power to oppose sexism, society still could blame them and ignore their opposition. So actually confronting sexism is dangerous, but if we let it slide there will be injustice in gender role. That is why by conducting this research hopefully could help society to fully accept women by not giving direct sexism or especially indirect sexism because as we can see from the three journals the object that is analyzed mostly used direct sexism.

In this part of the journal, the researcher will explain the theories that are used in this research. The researcher will explain the theory brought up by Brannon in her book *Gender: Psychological Perspectives* about gender stereotypes. The stereotype is a kind of generalization of a group of people based on their characteristics, for instance, their skin color, their behavior, or based on their gender. According to Brannon by making such grouping based on the characteristic or stereotyping people society could interact easily with others (Brannon, 2004, p. 166). And this goes the same with a gender stereotype.

According to Tyson gender is “…our cultural programming as feminine or masculine.” Someone is not born as feminine or masculine because society defines or constructs us to be one of them (Brannon, 2004, p. 86). From social construction society group women and men based on “…psychological trait, and characteristic of, as well as the activities appropriate to men or women” (Brannon, 2004, p. 160). Thus we could know how men or women should be and behave in order to be the real woman or man.

Brannon in her book explains that the Industrial Revolution changed the belief that women should stay at home and dealing with domestic activities while the men are working outside to earn money for the family. That is why there are two kinds of belief to define the appropriate behavior that should be done by woman and man: The Cult of Womanhood and the Doctrine of Two Sphere. The latest belief that women and men have a different interest; women’s interest goes around the home and children, while men’s interest is everything outside the home and work. While for The Cult of Womanhood is the judgment of women that is made by people around them and they also agree with the judgment. There are four types: *Piety* means religious, *Purity* means virginity, *Submissive* means weak, dependent, and timid, and *Domesticity* means that women should take care of the home and the children (Brannon, 2004, p. 161). To be more specific Williams and Bennett made a table that listed the stereotype trait based on women’s personality (Lips, 2008, p. 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Affected</th>
<th>Emotional</th>
<th>High-strung</th>
<th>Sentimental</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affectionate</td>
<td>Excitable</td>
<td>Meek</td>
<td>Softhearted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appreciative</td>
<td>Feminine</td>
<td>Mild</td>
<td>Sophisticated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attractive</td>
<td>Fickle</td>
<td>Nagging</td>
<td>Submissive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charming</td>
<td>Flirtatious</td>
<td>Prudish</td>
<td>Talkative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaining</td>
<td>Fussy</td>
<td>Rattlebrained</td>
<td>Weak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependent</td>
<td>Frivolous</td>
<td>Sensitive</td>
<td>Whiny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dreamy</td>
<td>Gentle</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Adjective Stereotypically associated with women

However this kind of judgment changes over the century. Even though there are some changes in stereotyping women there is still an effect that can arise because the time people giving a stereotypical statement to another group of people will give two effects which most of the time go together; prejudice and discrimination (Brannon, 2004, p. 167). Prejudice is a feeling about a person or a certain attitude we give to a person based on their membership in a group (Boyd, 2016). While for discrimination is unfair behavior that is given because they come from another group. This study shows the prejudice based on gender which called as Sexism (Brannon, 2004, p. 168) to women. The kind of prejudice which is given to women in this research is delivered through the language used in the magazine’s column *Women We Love*.

Language is used not only for giving information but also “… allows us to do things, and to be things…” (Gee, 2011, p. 2). This goes the same when society gives stereotype about women through language. The stereotypes that are made about women limit women in doing what they wanted to do. That
is why there is a movement called feminism which fights the inequality that society gives as the effect of stereotype.

In result there have been some changes about women’s position in society; women are now accepted to the nontraditional role such as go to work. It also proves with some studies that women have changed into a more egalitarian over the past years. Women are more associated into both traits of traditional and nontraditional gender role (Brannon, 2004, p. 172). Thus there is some attitude that society still gives to women which then considered to downgrade women because society still not fully accept the notion that women could break off from the traditional role. One of the attitudes that society give is through the language used.

Because society still not fully accept the notion, they put their ideology which downgrade women or sexist into a more subtle way or Sara Mills called it Indirect sexism in the language used. Indirect sexism is a way to deliver sexist without being seen as one because there is pressure from feminists who demand society to give an equal attitude toward women (Mills, 2008, p. 133). In delivering their sexist attitude, one will disguise it in-jokes or irony so others will need to make presupposition to define whether that utterance is sexist or not (Mills, 2008, p. 135).

Indirect sexism can be given through six kinds of forms which are proposed by Sara Mills in her book Language and Sexism:

1. Humor; it “…often exaggerates certain features associated with a group or draws on and plays with stereotypical knowledge for comic effect” (Mills, 2008, p. 140)
2. Presupposition; in this type of indirect sexism, sexism is difficult to find out because in delivering it the speaker has a potential chance to deny it
3. Conflicting Message; in order to avoid being called as sexist they make an utterance as not sexist as possible however in result the message that is delivered is conflicted with each other
4. Scripts and Metaphors; it is delivered through a narrative story about women and men in the public sphere who are compared using metaphorical language which usually shows women in a traditional way
5. Collocation; using words that have connection or company another word
6. Androcentric perspective; it is when the utterance is made from masculine perspectives.

2. Methodology

This study uses a critical approach and qualitative methodology which is fit with the aim and statement of the problem of the research. Qualitative is used because the main point is to describe social practices in order for society to understand and could explain the phenomenon or experiences that they are doing or have been done (Jackson, 1995, p. 17). While the critical approach is used because it criticizes how human has tendencies to make themselves in a powerful position than others, for instance, the tendency of men in trying to be in a powerful position than women. This approach also focuses on the object in powerless position which in this research is women. Thus by using this approach, it is expected that the society will have an even or egalitarian society where everyone is equal (Jackson, 1995, p. 11).

One of the critical approaches that often used is the Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) which the main purpose is to find out the relation between discourse and power relation (Van Dijk 250). In this case, the researcher expects that from the column Women We Love there is power relation between man and woman where man tries to dominate woman thus the researcher use Sara Mills’s CDA as the main approach.

In Sara Mills’s CDA usually show how text is used to downgrade women by looking at the position of actors involved in the text and the position of the reader which then resulted in making one of the actors in the story become legitimate (Eriyanto, 2008, pp. 199-200). There are two positions that need to be focused on when using this CDA; there is the subject-object position and another one is the reader position.

For media tend to have one particular actor (subject) to define or tell the story which then makes other actors (object) that are involved are being defined; this is the purpose of the subject-object position. In this stage in analyzing a discourse need to decide which one has the subject position and which one has the object position. The one who has a role as a subject in a discourse could define themselves and the story while for the object their existence is being defined by the subject (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 201). The
second position is readers position which is also important because Sara Mills believe that the role of reader needs to be counted for a text is the result of the negotiation process between writers and readers (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 203). Below is the table which explains what needs to be seen in order to find this two position in a text:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>What needs to be seen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject-object</td>
<td>-From whose perspective the text is described.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Who is positioned as subject and who is positioned as the object which needs subject to be told about.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Each actor in the text have the chance to describe themselves or their existence is described by others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Readers</td>
<td>How the readers are positioned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>How the readers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Subject-object position and Readers position (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 211)

The primary data of this research is the column of Esquire entitled Women We Love which talks about women who are successful in entertainer world; it explains about their profile start from how they start their career, their achievements, until about their ideal. This column is inserted in the magazine with the purpose to introduce the ideal women that Esquire’s men should love so that they will not embarrass themselves in front of their work. The articles that can be got by the researcher are nine articles from December 2015 edition until April 2016; which then only three are chosen to be the fix primary data.

As for the secondary data the researcher use books especially book by Sara Mills title Language and Sexism and other books related to gender stereotypes. In addition, the researcher also uses journals from other studies which have related issue or methodology with the research.

There are some steps to gather the data:
1. Collecting the magazine which can be collected and affordable
2. Choosing editions which have the column of Women We Love
3. Put the article of Women We Love into categories; if the article fit with the categories, the article will be chosen as the primary data to be analyzed. The categories or study range to decide the data used are:
   a. Mentioning about Education; by mentioning this it can be argued that this magazine agrees that women should get education, if they can higher education is better.
   b. Looking at the article’s title; if the title does not really show the objectification of women directly, then the article can be used.
   c. Mentioning about the women’s achievements; the achievement is used to see how well-known is the women and how long they have been in entertainment industry.

The articles chosen are:
1. Augustus 2015; Isyana Sarasvati (singer); The Musical Genius
2. December 2015; Ayushita (MC-Singer-Actress); The Extraordinary Ayushita
3. February 2016; Acha Septriasa (Actress); Act for Acha

After getting which article should be analyzed; the study then continues with these steps:
1. Analyzing each article using Sara Mills’s Critical Discourse Analysis which seeking out for the position of Subject-object and Readers in the text.
2. Finding the indirect language directed to show sexism
3. Categorize the language into types of Indirect Sexism proposed by Sara Mills; there are Humor, Presupposition, Conflicting Messages, Scripts and Metaphor, Collocation, or Androcentric Perspective.
4. Drawing Conclusion

3. Discussion

The three articles of Women We Love are analyzed using Sara Mills’s discourse analysis. In this part, each article’s analysis is explained with each interpretation then at the end the researcher draw conclusion from the analysis.
3.1. Women as Dependent Explorer

The first article of Women We Love is an edition from Esquire which was published in August 2015. Take The Musical Genius as its title and choose one new Indonesia singer Isyana Sarasvati; this article tells the reader about who is she and how she started off her career as a singer in Indonesia. This article also said that though she is still new in Indonesia music industry, she already stole Indonesians attention because of her music and many people anticipate her further activity in Indonesia’s music industry.

This article begins with how Isyana tells the reader about her family who likes to explore and how at first she actually wanted to be a composer for her like of music is especially supported by her mother. Then the article also tells the reader about her achievement in many music competitions in domestic or international. Thus she keeps pursuing her passion for music for her also studying it in abroad university and has finished it. Because of her knowledge about music is wide she could make her own music which is included in her album. Furthermore, this article also tells the reader that she is such a good listener for she mentions on how she could get inspiration to make music because many of her friends come to her to tell about their story. At the end of this article, she mentions her further plan and ambition to make a better music for Indonesia someday.

As mention above that this article starts with her direct statement about her family who likes to explore in the first paragraph of this article, it starts with:

“Aku besar dari keluarga yang suka bereksplorasi.”

(“I grow up from a family who like to explore.”)

By making this as the opening sentence for this article, the writer would like the reader to know that she likes to explore or like to learn many things especially exploring her music which then can be seen in the fifth paragraph.

“Isyana menyebut exploration of pop sebagai warna music yang diusung di album debut-nya.”

(“Isyana called exploration of pop as the kind of music that she has for her debut album)

In addition, this article also mentions her education which she took abroad; this then added as her trait as an explorer. By mentioning her music education abroad the writer would like the reader to know that she is brave enough to deepen her knowledge about music.

However though she is portrayed as a woman who likes to explore, the writer of this article also portrayed her as dependent which is in contrast with one of the traits of the real explorer which is being independent (finoo.org). It is mention that her mother is the one who gives her encouragement in doing music, which means that she still needs someone to decide her future. In addition the article mention about her coming with her manager which also means the writer wants the reader to know that she still needs a companion.

“Pagi itu, Isyana datang tepat waktu bersama seorang manajer”

(“That morning, Isyana came right in time with her manager”)

3.1.1. Subject-Object Position

It is obvious to say that the subject of this article is Isyana herself for this article begins with a direct statement from Isyana

“Aku besar dari keluarga yang suka bereksplorasi”

(“I grow up from a family who like to explore.”)

This means that the one who told the story in this article is Isyana herself; in addition in each paragraph the use of her name, the use of ‘Aku’ (‘I’), and affixes ‘-nya’ (‘her’) tends to be the starting words which also means that this article focuses on how Isyana is the one who told the story.

However, though Isyana is the one who told the story she does not have full authority to express herself. It is because the writer of this article still put their opinion about her which resulted in how they also defined her. It proves on how the writer gives a conclusion about her personality by directly saying
that she is an ‘introvert’; the writer makes that kind of conclusion just because she said she likes to play music in her free time.

“Itsyana yang memiliki kepribadian introvert, mengaku lebih suka berinteraksi dengan piano daripada harus menghabiskan waktu untuk hal-hal lain.”

(“Isyana who is an introvert, admit that she like to interact with piano rather to spend her time doing something else”)

There is also a sentence which indicates that she is being defined is when the writer gives their opinion about their first impression of her.

“Bila bertemu dengannya pertama kali, wajah Itsyana yang terkesan ‘dingin’ mungkin akan memancing persepsi bahwa ia adalah sosok yang kurang rama. Tapi jika sudah berbicara banyak dengannya, akan terlihat bahwa ia adalah seorang yang hangat dan gemar sekali bercanda.”

(“If someone meet her for the first time, her ‘cold’ face will make the perception that she is not friendly. But if we talk with her, she will be seen as a friendly person and like to joke around”)

By giving an opinion about the writer’s first impression in this article will make Isyana does not have the opportunity to explain about herself. In addition, if we take a look at the sentence the writer did not put Itsyana’s direct statement which could show whether the writer’s statement is true or not.

There are some objects that are told by her: family, career, education, friends or colleague, and ideal man. As Sara Mills said that writers always calculate what topic or materials they should put so that the readers interested to read the text (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 203); this goes the same with this article, the writers only put what the readers want to know about Isyana.

They mention how she built her career and how she has a good education to show that she is a successful and educated woman who supposed to have an independent life. However, they also mention about a family which then resulted as writer’s effort so that the readers know that she is a family oriented who like to have her family’s advice to decide her future; as it mentions “Ketertarikannya pada Musk diawali dari dorongan sang Ibu…” (“She got interested with music was started with her mother’s support”). In addition, there is also a statement saying “Pagi itu, Itsyana datang tepat waktu bersama seorang manajer…” (“That morning, Itsyana came right in time along with her manager”)

3.1.2. Readers Position

In analyzing this part the researcher needs to see how the writer of this article address the reader; is it direct address or indirect address, but mostly Mills said that usually, the writer uses the indirect one which then leads the reader to choose whose side do they positioned (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 208).

In this article, the writer takes the readers to be the observer of Itsyana by taking the readers to the real situation when the writer met with Itsyana. It can be seen on how the writer gives a detail explanation about the settings and Itsyana’s gesture when she met with the writer.

“Saat itu, ruangan untuk sesi pemotretan memiliki suhu yang agak panas karena memiliki jendela yang cukup besar… Dari sesi pemotretan itu kemudian terlihat kebiasaan Itsyana yang terkesan lucu. Ia gemar menggerak-gerakkan jarinya…”

(“At that time, the shooting site was a little bit hot because of its wide window… From the photography session it can be see Itsyana’s habit which look

After analyzing how the writer addresses the reader, the next step is to find out to whom this article is directed to. For Sara Mills discourse is focusing on the gender issue, she is concern whether a text is directed to a man or woman (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 209). This article can make man or woman as the reader; it can be directed to woman because there is no direct or indirect statement which can be considered as making man as the dominant readers except when we take a look at the big picture; this article is put in men’s magazine which then makes man as the dominant readers but if we only take a look at the article itself, it can see by two points of view from woman and man.
3.2. The Extra Ordinary Woman

In this second article, the column has Ayushita as the woman that Esquire men should love. Taking The Extraordinary Ayushita as the title this column starts with how the writer explains that she is a multitalented artist who could sing, acting, MCing, and modeling. She started as a child artist then grows up into a beautiful and successful artist whose works are always anticipated by many people. But there is a time when suddenly she disappears from showbiz without giving any notices to her fans. Like the previous article, this article also talks about her career, how she started her career in the beginning, and in the end, the writer gives her a chance to describe her ideal man.

By taking The Extraordinary Ayushita as the title, the writer wants the reader to see Ayushita as an extraordinary woman because she has many talents and got famous because of those talents which can be seen in the opening paragraph in the article

“Orang-orang melihatnya tumuh dan berkembang dari seorang aktris remaja hingga kemudian menjelma bintang multitalenta. Dia juga sempat bersinar dengan beberapa prestasi yang diraihnya…”

(“People see her growing up and turn from a teenage actress into a multitalented star. She also got many achievements…”)

In Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary extraordinary means “not normal or ordinary; greater or better than usual” or in other words “very unusual” (merriam-webster.com) thus when the writer put The Extraordinary Ayushita the readers could expect that she is different or not like any ordinary women because of her career.

However, this article still sees her in a stereotypical way means that she is seen as what women should be or behave in order to be the real woman. Despite her success in career, she is seen as not professional in her career which can be inferred from when the writer writes on how she chooses her job or work

“Dalam memilih setiap tawaran yang datang, Ayushita selalu menomorsatukan kenyamanan.”

(“In choosing her job, Ayushita always put comfort as the first priority.”)

In that sentence, it can be inferred that the writer sees her as not professional because she put her emotion first in choosing her job, and being emotional is one of the traits that society give to women (Lips 7).

In addition later on the researcher also explain how Ayushita is being described by other parties even though she has The Extraordinary Ayushita as her title. This article does not give her chance to explain about herself as she directly made into this article’s object.

3.2.1. Subject-Object Position

Different from the previous article, the subject is not the woman. Instead, the subjects are other parties. While the woman, Ayushita, is the object. As Putrayasa said that to identify subject we could use question ‘who’ or ‘what’. This article starts with “Mencari waktu yang tepat untuk bisa bertemu dengan Ayushita…” (“Finding time to meet with Ayushita…”), then when we put the question ‘who’ answer will make them as the subject thus the subject is the one who arranges a meeting with Ayushita which is the writer.

In addition, the subject is the one who has authority to tell the story to others, but in this article, Ayushita does not have the chance to tell her story by herself or define herself which then make her as the object of this article. This can be seen on how the writer arranges the structure of sentences and paragraphs. They tend to put their opinion about her by making a conclusion from her direct statement.

“Sejak dulu, Ayushita memang tidak ingin terlalu ngoyo dalam mengejar berbagai peluang untuk menancapkan eksistensinya di dunia hiburan… ‘Saat mendapat pengumuman kalau aku masuk BBB, aku bahkan sudah lupa kalau aku pernah ikut audisinya.’...”

(“It has been a long time that Ayushita tends to not force herself when looking out for chances to hold her existence in entertainment… ‘When I heard the announcement that I could join BBB, even then I forgot that I have applied for the audition.’...”)
From this sentence, we could see that the writer make a conclusion about her not forcing herself in choosing job only because Ayushita said that she once forgot that she had applied for an audition.

3.2.2. Reader Position

As the previous article analyzes how the readers are addressed, this article also uses the same. But different from the previous article which makes an indirect address to the readers, this article uses direct address because this article directly addresses the reader by saying the reader's name

“Apakah pernyataan ini sebuah kode terselubung darinya untuk menantang pria pembaca Esquire? Anda cari tahu saya sendiri.”

(“Is it a hidden code from her to challenge Esquire men readers? Find out yourself.”)

The sentence use ‘Anda’ (you) and ‘pembaca Esquire’ (Esquire readers) to directly address the readers which then can be inferred that this article asks for the readers’ agreement about her and convince the reader (Mills in (Eriyanto, 2008, p. 204)) that Ayushita is the women that Esquire readers (men) should love.

From that sentence, we could also infer that this article makes men as their dominant reading because as we can see the writer make a direct address to ‘pria pembaca Esquire’ (Esquire men readers). Sara Mills said that many texts are positioned their reader as man readers (in Eriyanto 210).

3.3. Women need Materials, Fame, and Man to be The Real Woman

In the last article talks about Acha Septiari as an actress who got famous because she play in mellow drama movie Hearts in 2006. Since then on she keeps pursuing her career in acting and got an acknowledgment in her acting which then make her sore higher and successful which is why the article takes Act for Acha as the title.

However, that title may seem to look like how this article focuses on how Acha give meaning about acting. But this title also means that in order to get Acha men to need to ‘act’ now, as the opening paragraph said “Gentlemen anda berani menjadi pasangan hidup Acha? ACT NOW!” (“Gentlemen, Do you dare to be Acha’s partner (spouse). ACT NOW!”). In that sentence the article challenges the readers, men, to make an action for Acha because though she already successful and got an acknowledgment in acting and got fame, she still needs men to make her into the real woman.

3.3.1. Subject-Object Position

The article makes Acha as the subject for how they put “Acha datang tepat waktu…” (“Acha came right in time...”) as the first sentence to begin the first paragraph. Furthermore, they start the paragraph by using her name like “Acha memulai kariernya…” (“Acha started her career...”) or “Acha pun mengakui…” (“Acha admits that...”); if all of these sentences’ verb is put with ‘who’ question would resulted in Acha as the answer.

However, even though she is the subject of this article who supposed to have the freedom to express herself there is still control from the writer of this story. For instance in how the article explains about her appearance when she met with the Esquire team in the first paragraph.

“Acha datang tepat waktu. Dia datang tanpa asisten, membawa sendiri satu tas besar berisi busana untuk pemotretan… Wajahnya nyaris tanpa riasan dan berbusana santai…”

(“Acha came right in time. She came without an assistant, bring one bag full of her outfit for the photography session by herself… Her face almost without makeup and wearing casual outfit...”)  

For the object position, the article takes her career story and ideal man as the object. In the article, it is said that there is a time when she got hesitate in doing her career because she is doing something that she does not really mean to or as she said “Disisi musik, aku sudah ‘diakui’ karena mampu ‘berjulang’ album 2.5 juta kopi… Tapi jiwa aku bukan disitus…” (“In the music industry, I have been ‘admitted’ because could ‘sell’ 2.5 billion copies of album… But my passion is not there...”) By mentioning this, the reader will have an idea that she does music for she wants to seek more popularity. Also in the opening
paragraph, they mention on how acting could satisfy her materials needs and fame, but those do not satisfy her need as a woman; she needs a man to be a real woman.

“Selama itu acting sudah memberinya kepuasaan materi dan eksistensi. Sayangnya akting tak membawanya pada kepuasan seorang wanita.”

(“… Since then acting has given her satisfaction in material and existences (fame). Unfortunately, acting does not give her full satisfaction as a woman; have husband and family”)

From the statements above, man is seen as something important for a woman even though woman already has something they really want to do and could make them as an independent woman.

3.3.2. Reader position

The use of ‘kami’ (‘we’) makes the readers outside of the text or in this case as the ‘watcher’. As mention, the article also describes how Acha dresses up when meeting up with Esquire team which then make the reader has an image of Acha in their head when reading this article. It can be inferred that the watcher is a man because the article put question sentence for the reader to answer when reading it

“Apa berani menjadi pasangan hidup Acha?”

(“Dare to be Acha’s spouse?”)

This question is obviously directed for a man out there who read this article.

In addition, the readers here are positioned to agree with what the writer says about Acha. The writer put the reader as passive readers because at the end of the article there is a statement that asks the readers

“Apa pria dengan criteria tadi? Mungkin Anda bisa mulai bergerak mendekati Acha sekarang”.

(“Are you the one with those criteria? Maybe you should start to get close to Acha now”)

This statement’s tone makes it as the readers like Acha for they do not put a question sentence asking whether they like a woman like Acha or not.

3.4. Indirect Sexism Language

As mention in the theoretical framework, Sara Mills divided six types of indirect sexism that may be used to deliver sexism in a subtle way; some of the types can be seen in the articles. First, Humor which often used to deliver subtle sexism can be seen in the third article. In that article when the writer asks about Acha’s activity, she mentions that she is busy with many promotional things for her new movies then the Esquire team ask back

“Astaga, sibuknya. Kejar setoran?”

(“Oh My God, so busy, do you want to catch up your salary target that fast?”)

This question may be just an intermezzo to make the situation at that time more friendly and Acha’s respond also positive, she laugh with them which Sunderland believe as one of the response to sexism (in Mills 14). However, it still makes Acha becomes a woman who chooses acting as her passion into a materialistic woman.

Second, the conflicting message can be found in the second article when the writer gives comment about her saying that they have seen how Ayushita has grown up into the successful Ayushita like now.

“Tiba-tiba saya menyadari satu hal, saya adalah salah seorang yang meskipun bukan penggemar beratnya tetapi telah menyaksikan gadis ini tumbuh hingga dewasa seperti sekarang.”

(“Then I realize one thing, I, who is not her big fan of her, have seen this girl (Miss) grown up and turn into an adult, like now.”)

If we as the reader take a look at the sentences above, we find nothing wrong with the sentences; we would think that the sentences are written to praise Ayushita that she has grown up into a fine adult (dewasa). However, the use of ‘gadis’ means a girl who is not married yet or in English can be called as ‘Miss’, and in Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary define ‘Miss’ as a “young woman or girl” which then conflicted with the title of this column.
They are saying that they should love a ‘woman’ which means “an adult female human” (Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary) but in this sentence, they use ‘gadis’ or in English ‘Miss’. Thus this article still does not see Ayushita as an adult woman but as a young woman who needed to be watched and protected because she is not fully mature. And this kind of attitude is shown to give a form of ambivalence “…for it includes connotations of both domination (dominative paternalism) as well as affection and protection (protective paternalism)” (Fiske, 1996, p. 493)

And the last is collocation where the word can be collocated or always has relationships with women. That kind of word can be found in the first article when the writer explains their first impression when seeing Isyana for the first time. They said that Isyana may look ‘cold’ which would make people say that she is not that friendly, however, once they talk to her they change their perception saying that she is a warm person and like to joke around.

“Tapi jika sudah berbicara banyak dengannya, akan terlihat bahwa ia adalah seorang yang hangat dan gemar sekali bercanda.”

(“But if we talk to her, it could be seen that she is a warm person and like to joke around”)

They use the word “hangat” which means warm; warm here means that she is an affectionate person. And this word collocates with one of the women’s adjective stereotype trait that William and Bennett suggest in Lips’ book (Lips, 2008, p. 7).

The stereotype is given to make it easier for people to live in this complicated world (Brannon, 2004, p. 166). However there is an effect that is resulted from it; by giving stereotype to a certain group, people will also give different feeling or attitude to that group which can be called Prejudice.

Sexism is one kind of prejudice given by people according to a person’s sexual category (Lips, 2008, p. 17). Because of this, the attitude or how people treat other gender is different; at the past women used to be left out from decision making, they are banned from giving a vote, and demanded to stay at home and take care of the children because of the stereotype people give about women. However since there are many women who fight for the equal rights sexism does not mean a completely hate feeling anymore; it can be positive but still put women in a stereotypical way.

As Fiske and Glick said in their research that the attitude toward women can be called as ambivalence because it consists of positive (Benevolent sexism) and negative (Hostile sexism) attitude. They said that “…sexist men have genuinely positive feelings, as well as hostile attitude, toward women and that the desire to project and protect an egalitarian image is much less relevant to explaining sexist behavior.” (494) In other words, ambivalent sexism is given because men realize that they still need women because women have dyadic power where “…wives, mothers, and idealization of women as romantic love objects.” (492) are woman’s role which cannot be replaced by a man. So, though there are these egalitarian women, men cannot fully give them hostility but also give them a positive attitude.

This can be seen from the articles above; the writer of the articles does not give a hostile attitude toward egalitarian women, which in this case the women who are successful chose entertainment or art as their passion. It is because the writer realizes that men still need women to be their wives, their child’s mother, and as their romantic love objects. That is why this column ask the readers or challenge them whether they want to make the women as their spouse or not like in the second article, there is this sentence

“Gentlemen, Anda berani menjadi pasangan Hidup Acha?...”

(“Gentlemen, Do you dare to be Acha’s partner (spouse)?”)

They challenge them because they are aware that women are successful in pursuing their career and could be independent. And they are aware that the targets of this magazine, businessmen, demand women who could follow them well and good in doing domestic activities.

Sexism can be expressed in many ways, one of the ways is by language. As Lips said that “Not all sexism is obvious. In fact, since so many people are aware of the disapproval that may greet the expression
of gender stereotypes, they often express such stereotypes in subtle ways.” (Lips, 2008, p. 19) So Sara Mills proposes indirect sexism as one type of language used to deliver sexism in a subtle way.

The three articles show that women could do what they wanted and be successful in doing their passion. However the way the articles deliver the text still objectify women in a subtle way by making the women as the subject who supposed to be the one who told the story and define themselves, but in those three articles, we cannot see the women have a chance to define themselves. In addition by using indirect language to show sexism toward women, this magazine cannot fully accept that women could define themselves and be independent.

It can be seen from the title of the column Women We Love; it seems after reading the article and go back to read the title of the column the readers, which also included the researcher, are made to believe that men like women who are successful in their career. However, if we take a close look in how they arrange the story of each article; at the end of the article they always ask the women about their ideal men which then resulted in no matter successful a woman is, the woman still needs a man to make them the ‘real woman’. In addition by giving the women’s career story and asking their ideal type, it makes the column like a ‘portfolio’ about what kind of women that men should choose to be their partner in life. Thus this article despite the positive attitude toward successful women, they still objectify them and make them a group of people who need men’s protection. For the latter can be seen in the first article; the writer use ‘gadis’ or ‘miss’ for Ayushita instead of ‘wanita’ meaning that though she could earn something from her career she is still not ‘woman’ or not mature yet, that is why she needs protection from a man. In addition in the third article, Acha though she is depicted as a woman who is successful and could be independent; the article still cannot let her be fully independent, she still needs men which is why the article keep challenging the reader to be Acha’s spouse.

4. Conclusion

When living in a diverse environment society cannot help but making a title for a group of people who have the same traits or behavior which then called as Stereotype. There are many kinds of grouping that society makes, one of them is based on gender; masculine and feminine. By making stereotype based on gender society could define what kind of men or women can be called as the real men or women. However, this kind of stereotyping make society give men or women different attitude, especially on women. Because to be the real women, women need to only deal with domestic work such as to be a housewife or taking care of the children. Thus make them have limited access outside the home; for instance, women used to be banned to give a vote and even if they have work they will not have the same amount of wage.

This kind of attitude that is given based on the certain group is called prejudice. And a kind of prejudice that is directed at women has been a hot issue to be talked about. Thus many women who called themselves as feminists are struggling to get equal rights for women. In result, many societies nowadays tries to be more open-minded and not depend on stereotype when judging people, including in judging women. The negative prejudice that is given by society is now lesser than in the past. For instance, society now can accept women to do what they wanted to do like pursuin their career and be independent, this magazine still cannot let women have the full freedom and be fully independent.

However there are still many studies that argue if the prejudice that is given to women still exists but in a subtle way, one of the examples that the researcher takes is one of the column title Women We Love in men’s magazine Esquire Indonesia. In this column, it has been proved that even though it praises women on how they could pursue their career and be independent, this magazine still cannot let women have the full freedom and be fully independent.

With using Critical Discourse Analysis and Indirect sexism in language theory by Sara Mills, the researcher found out that this magazine uses indirect sexism or a kind of subtle way to deliver sexism. By using CDA the researcher knows that most of the time this column makes the women as the subject however they do not let them have full control when it is time to define about themselves. In addition according to Sara Mills, there are several types of indirect sexism that can be used and most of them are actually difficult to find out.

Despite the difficulties the researcher successfully found out that there are four types of indirect sexism that this column used: Humor, conflicting message, collocation, and Androcentric perspectives. From the
indirect sexism that is used this column often make it as seems they agree with women who could do their passion and be successful with it, but they still put the women into stereotype category which means that this column still does not fully accept the notion of independent women.

5. Work Cited


