Comparison of English Narrative Writing Produced by Bilingual and that by non-Bilingual Class at SMP Negeri 4 Surabaya

Winda Septiani Putri

Jurianto

English Department, Universitas Airlangga

Abstract

The widespread use of English as an international language in the world has influenced many aspects of education. One of the aspects is associated with the application of a two-class system, bilingual and non-bilingual class. This study is concerned with writing products in second language writing, which aims to compare the narrative writing in English produced by bilingual and non-bilingual students at SMP Negeri 4 Surabaya. In this study, the writer collected the data using qualitative method with 74 respondents, students from two groups: bilingual and non-bilingual classes that were asked to make narrative text about folklore. The writer analyzed and assessed the written products by using analytic rubric theory proposed by Bayreli and Ari (2009). In the analysis the writer focused on language and expression properties. Finally, the written products were related to the process of teaching writing in second language writing by using the theory proposed by Seow (2002). Based on the analysis, the writer found most of the narrative texts produced by bilingual students can be said to belong to the category of average to good in each part of language and expression properties. On the other hand, the narrative texts produced by non-bilingual students tend to belong to the category of poor to average almost in each part of language and expression properties.

Keywords: analytic rubric, bilingual, narrative text, second language writing, teaching English writing

Introduction

The widespread use of English as an international language in the world has influenced many aspects of education. One of the aspects is associated with the application of a two-class system, bilingual and non-bilingual class, which occurs from elementary school to high school (Junior High School and Senior High School). Bilingual education is a system that uses two languages as media of instruction in the part or entire school curriculum (Andersson, Boyer, & Southwest Educational Development Laboratory cited in Pacific Policy Research Center, 2010). In general bilingual class has different characteristics from non-bilingual class, particularly in the processes of teaching learning and the characteristics of students. “The different process and knowledge cause different results” (Ali, 2002). Therefore, in this study the writer would like to see the differences in capability between bilingual and non-bilingual classes in writing English narrative text as a second language skill because writing in a second language has a big challenge in social and cognitive aspects related to second language acquisition. Moreover, in composing, developing, and analyzing ideas of writing requires conscious effort, keep practicing and learning through experience (Myles, 2002). In addition, narrative text is a text that has complex characteristics considered difficult to be learned by students.

There have been some studies about the writing products. Yanqun (2009) examined the cross-linguistic influence in second language writing at both process and product levels among 20 Chinese college students. In terms of process, the study reveals that though the proportion of L1 thinking decreases with the improvement of English proficiency, the extent of decrease varies with different composing activities. In terms of product, the learners with higher English proficiency exhibit a decrease in the total number of transfer errors, yet the decrease varies with different categories. Ali (2002) identified the writing processes in L1 (Arabic) and L2 (English) of twelve Third-Year Libyan University Students (TYLUS), as they verbalized and produced written texts in both languages. The
study also investigated the process and product data separately to see if any relationship exists between an individual subject's process skill and product quality in either language. Alhaisoni (2012) investigated about English language writing planning strategies (WPSs) of Saudi Arabian third-year male university students and the effect of writing proficiency on the frequency of use of these strategies.

The brief review above indicates that research that compares writing products in second language writing with different class characteristic which is related to the process of teaching writing has never been conducted. Therefore, in this study, the writer compares the English narrative text produced by bilingual and non-bilingual class at SMP Negeri 4 Surabaya, because in this school, bilingual system was applied. In this study, the writer raises two problems to be answered:

1. What are the differences in language and expression properties of the narrative writing in English produced by bilingual and non-bilingual class in SMP Negeri 4 Surabaya?
2. Are the differences affected by the teaching and learning process conducted in the bilingual and non-bilingual class?

Methodology

In this study, the writer collected the data from 74 students of two groups: bilingual and non-bilingual classes. From each class the total numbers of the students are 37 with the average ages of 13 to 14 years old, in the academic year 2012/2013. The data required was narrative texts produced by the participants. In addition, the writer also conducted observation to examine the process of teaching writing in the two classes. The writer analyzed and assessed the English narrative text using analytic rubric based on the theory of Bayreli and Ari (2009), focusing on language and expression properties because these aspects are important for learners of a second language particularly for beginners like elementary and junior high school students. Finally, the results of data analysis were related to the process of teaching writing in second language writing based on the theory of Seow (2002).

Result and Discussion

Based on the analysis, the writer found that there were differences in the writing products’ qualities between two different class systems, bilingual and non-bilingual classes. Most of the narrative texts produced by bilingual students can be said to belong to the category of average to good in each part of language and expression properties, and even some of them belong to very good category. On the other hand, the narrative texts produced by non-bilingual students tend to belong to the category of poor to average almost in each part of language and expression properties. The writer also shows a summary of comparison table to clear up the differences between two classes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Properties</th>
<th>Narrative Writing of Bilingual Class Students</th>
<th>Narrative Writing of non-Bilingual Class Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Vocabulary</td>
<td>- The use of vocabulary in most of the texts is correct and appropriate.</td>
<td>- The use of vocabulary in most of the texts is not correct, not appropriate, and also less understandable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The use of past tense verbs in most of the narrative texts is correct.</td>
<td>- The use of past tense verbs in most of the narrative texts is incorrect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sentence</td>
<td>- Almost all of the texts have correct sentences of varying structures and orders.</td>
<td>- Most of the texts have incorrect sentences of monotonous structures and orders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Most of the texts have sentences that are linked to each other well.</td>
<td>- Most of the texts do not have sentences that are linked to each other well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Paragraph</td>
<td>- Most of the texts contain paragraphs that have subject unity.</td>
<td>- Some of the texts do not contain paragraphs that have subject unity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Transitions and links between paragraphs in most of the texts are appropriate.</td>
<td>-Transitions and links between paragraphs in most of the texts are less inappropriate or not logical.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Expression</td>
<td>- Almost all of the texts conform to the type and style of narrative text: generic structures and features.</td>
<td>-Some of the texts do not conform to the type and style of narrative text: generic structures and features.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some of the texts do not present the story logically, and the story does not flow smoothly.

Table 1 Summary of the Result of Analysis of Narrative Texts

According to the summary of comparison table above, we can see that there are some differences in narrative writing products between bilingual and non-bilingual class in each property. In the next section, the writer describes and explains differences between texts of bilingual class and texts of non-bilingual class in each property along with examples of each class.

**Vocabulary Property**

In this section, the writer describes the differences in the use of vocabulary in narrative writing between bilingual students and non-bilingual students. In the analysis of vocabulary section, the writer does not only explain the use of vocabulary, but also describes the use of past tense verbs, because the text is narrative. In the following explanation, the writer describes the narrative writing of bilingual students with the theme folklore, and the narrative writing of non-bilingual students with the same theme.

**The legend of Rawa Pening (Bilingual)**

Once upon a time, there was a little poor boy came into a little village. He was very hungry. He asked to every people for some food, but nobody cared about him. Nobody wanted to help the little poor boy. Then a generous woman helped him. She gave him shelter and meal. When the boy wanted to leave, the woman gave him lesung. After that, the boy was very happy, then the boy continued his journey. When he was passing the village, he saw many people challenged to pull out a stick, but nobody succeeded. “Can I try?” asked the little boy. The boy stepped forward and pull out the stick easily. Suddenly, from the hole left by stick, water sponted out until it flooded the village and no one saved from the water, except the boy and the woman who gave him meal. The boy use lesung as a boat and pick up the woman.

In the narrative text above, the student uses vocabulary correctly and appropriately, making the text meaningful, and the event and situation of the text is conveyed well to the reader. It can be seen from the words used in texts: ‘once upon a time, there was a little poor boy came into a little village. He was very hungry’. In the first sentence, the student uses vocabulary appropriately in a sequence of sentence that shows subject, time signal and place. In the sentence, the student uses the expression ‘was very hungry’ to show how the condition of the subject in the first sentence. In the next sentences, the student makes the story flow smoothly with the selection of vocabulary in a sequence of sentences that are consistent with the existing situation such as ‘He asked to every people for some food, but nobody cared about him. Nobody wanted to help the little poor boy. Then a generous woman helped him. She gave him shelter and meal’.

The student also uses a set of phrases appropriately that could convey how the situations or events in the story. It could be seen in the phrases like ‘to pull out’ and ‘pick up.’ After the student uses those phrases, in the next sentence the student uses an appropriate vocabulary, so that the story is more meaningful. Besides, from the narrative text above, we can see that the student uses most past tense verbs in narrative text correctly. The text only has two mistakes in the use of past tense verb and one mistake in the use of connector. It can be seen in line eight ‘sponted’ that must become [spouted]. Moreover, in line ten the verb ‘use’ must be followed by suffix -d [used], and in line one after the words ‘there was a little poor boy’, it must has a connector ‘who’. The narrative text above is included in a good category in the use of vocabulary, set phrases and past tense verbs. In the next example, the writer explains the narrative writing of a non-bilingual student also with the same theme.

**Cinderella (Non-Bilingual)**

Once upon a time, there was a girl called Cinderella. Cinderella lived happily with her mother and father until her mother died. Feel that Cinderella needed a mother figure in his life, Cinderella’s father remarried to a widow with two daughters. Everyday, Cinderella’s stepmother ask to Cinderella for cleaning them house, Cinderella’s stepmother and Cinderella’s step daughters have a bad behavior. Their mother gave them many handsome dresses to wear. One day, two stepsister’s receieved an invitation to the ball that the think son was going to give at the palace. They were exited about his and spend so much time choosing the dresserser they would wear Cinderella cry.

28
From the narrative above, we can see that the student uses vocabulary inappropriately and sometimes incorrectly. Therefore, the text is less meaningful and the events and situations of the story are not conveyed well to the reader, which makes the reader confused to read the story. In the non-bilingual student’s text above, in each line of the story there are some vocabularies that are inappropriate and less meaningful. For instance, in line four, the student uses the possession pronoun inappropriately in the sentence ‘Cinderella’s stepmother ask to Cinderella for cleaning them house’. Actually, the word ‘them house’ should be replaced with the words ‘their house’. Moreover, in line five, the student uses the words ‘step daughters’ incorrectly in ‘Cinderella’s stepmother and Cinderella’s step daughters have a bad behavior’. The words ‘step daughters’ should be replaced with the words ‘step sisters’, because actually they refer to Cinderella’s sisters, not Cinderella’s daughters. There are also mistakes or inappropriate use of vocabularies in the next sentences like ‘handsome dresses’ in line six, ‘exited about his’ and ‘dressesser’ in line seven and eight.

After describing and explaining the vocabulary property, the writer continues to explain the use of past tense verbs in the narrative text above. Similar with the explanation of vocabulary property, in this narrative text, the writer explains each line. We can also see in the use of past tense verbs that the student is still confused and has some mistakes. For example, in line four, in the sentence ‘Cinderella’s step mother ask to Cinderella’, the verb ‘ask to’, must become ‘asked’, because in the narrative text, the verb is past tense. In line five, the word ‘have’ in the sentence ‘Cinderella’s step mother and Cinderella’s step daughters have a bad behavior’ should be ‘had’. Another example, in line seven the word ‘spend’ in ‘spend so much time choosin’ should be ‘spent’. The second narrative text above written by a non-bilingual student is included in a poor category in the use of vocabulary, set phrases and past tense verbs.

**Sentence Property**

In this section the writer describes the differences of sentences in the narrative writing produced by bilingual students and non-bilingual students. In terms of sentence property, the differences in the narrative texts can be seen in variety of sentence structures and orders, and also links between sentences.

**The Myth of Malin Kundang (Bilingual)**

A long time ago, in a small village near the beach in west Sumatra, a woman and her son lived. They were Malin Kundang and her mother. Her mother was a single parent, because Malin Kundang’s father had passed away when he was a baby.

One day, when Malin Kundang was sailing, he saw a merchant ship that was stormed by a small group of hijackers. With brave and power, Malin Kundang defeating pirates. Merchant was so happy and grateful to him. In return, the merchant asked malin Kundang to sail with him.

Many years later, Malin Kundang be rich. He had a big ship and assisted by a crew which included merchandise. He had a beautiful wife too. When he sailed trafficking journey, the ship landed on a beach near a small village. The villagers recognized him. The news ran fast in the village. An old woman ran to the beach to meet the new rich merchant. She was the mother of Malin Kundang. She wanted to hug him, released her sadness became lonely after so long. Unfortunately, when the mother came, malin kundang in front of her dressing and denies crew met an old lonely woman. He would leave the old mother again, but in that time, he was full of sadness.

Finally enraged, she cursed malin Kundang that he will turn to stone if he d not apologize. Malin Kundang just laughed and really sailing. In a calm sea, a sudden storm came, large vessels were damaged and it was too late for Malin Kundang to apologize. He thrown by the wave out of ship. He fell on a small island. It is really too late for him to avoid the curse. Suddenly, he turned to stone.

In the narrative text above, the student uses correct sentence structures and orders. The sentences in the story contain subject, predicate, object, and information elements (time, place, etc) that are appropriate with English sentence structures. The student is also able to vary the sentences structures. It can be seen from the first sentence, the student gives a time signal. In the next sentence the student explains the place of the story clearly and in detail. After that, the student describes about the character(s) of the story. In the opening of the story, the student uses sentences of varying structures...
and orders, so that the sentences in the story are not monotonous. After opening the story, the student tells about the situation of how Malin Kundang as the main character of the story gets his new job to start his new life. It can be seen in the next paragraph with the sentence:

One day, when Maling Kundang was sailing he saw a merchant ship that was stormed by a small group of hijackers. With brave and power, Malin Kundang defeating pirates. Merchant was so happy and grateful to him. In return, the merchant asked malin Kundang to sail with him.

In the next part, the student tells about the new life of Malin Kundang. The student explains that Malin Kundang was very wealthy, which can be seen in the sentences ‘Many years later, Malin Kundang be rich’ and ‘He had a big ship and assisted by a crew which included merchandise. He had a beautiful wife too’. After that, the student arranges the sentence that conveys the first meeting of Malin Kundang and his mother in the story. It can be seen from the sentences ‘when he sailed trafficking journey, the ship landed on a beach near a small village. The villagers recognized him. The news ran fast in the village. An old woman ran to the beach to meet the new rich new merchants.’

Furthermore, the student shows beginning of complication with the sentence:

an old woman ran to the beach to meet the new rich merchant. She was the mother of Malin Kundang. She wanted to hug him, released her sadness became lonely after so long. Unfortunately, when the mother came, Malin Kundang in front of her dressing and denies crew met an old lonely woman. He would leave the old mother again, but in that time he was full of sadness.

From that sentence, actually the student shows how the first time the problem or complication occurred. After that, the student shows the complication of the story with the sentence ‘she cursed Malin Kundang that he will turn to stone if he didn’t apologize. Malin Kundang just laughed’. Moreover, the rise of the problem or complication is conveyed in the next sentence and in the end followed by resolution.

The explanations above shows that in the bilingual student’s text, the use of sentence structures and orders is appropriate. Besides, the student is able to vary the structures and orders of the text, so that the message of the story is clear. Moreover, links between sentences in the text of bilingual student also perfect, and the last, each sentence can convey the purpose of the story. According to the text above, the text is included in a very good category. In the following section, the writer explains the narrative writing of non-bilingual student also with the same theme.

**Malin Kundang (Non-Bilingual)**

An old woman and her son lived in a little village. Her son was called Malin Kundang. They were very poor, but they loved each other very much. Malin Kundang grew up as a skillful young. He always helped his mother to get money. However, because they were only helpers fisherman, they are still living in poverty. One day, MalinKundang told his mother that he wanted to sail abroad, his mother did not approve, but Malin Kundang have made a decision did not approve, but Malin Kundanghave made a decision. Malin Kundang mother until approved walu with great disappointment.

Many years later, Malin Kundang be rich. He has a big ship and had a beautiful wife too. When he sailed travel trade, the ship landed on a beach near a small village. And old woman ran to the beach to meet the new rich merchant. She is the Malin Kundang mother. The old woman, call Malin Kundang. But Malin Kundang said to her “pretty lady, my parents never had a mother like you, a dirty and ugly woman”. Because of mounting anger, Malin’s mother tipper his hand saying “oh my god, if he is my son, I had sworn he became a rock”. After that, Malin Kundang body slowly be comes rigid and eventually formed into stone eventually.

The example above shows there are no significant differences in terms of the length of sentences, but non-bilingual student seems still confused about using correct sentence structures containing subject, predicate, object, and information. Moreover, the student does not vary sentences in the story. This is indicated in the opening of the story, ‘An old woman and her son lived in a little village. Her son was called Malin Kundang. They were very poor but they loved each other’. Different from bilingual students, the non-bilingual student shows the character of the story directly without any explanation, making the story less clear and monotonous. Furthermore, the order of some sentences in the text above is less proper to the situation conveyed in the story. It can be seen in each
sentence in the first paragraph to the last paragraph. For instance, in the first paragraph with the sentence:

‘Malin Kundang told his mother that he wanted to sail abroad, his mother did not approve, but Malin Kundang have made a decision. Malin Kundang mother until approved walu with a great disappointment.’

The student actually wants to convey that Malin Kundang has a desire to go to the city, but in that situation, his mother did not agree Malin’s desire. However, the student does not arrange well the sentences, which means that the student is not able yet to make the sentences flow smoothly. In the second paragraph, the student suddenly tells about Malin’s wealth, and then the student tells about the meeting of Malin Kundang with his mother.

3.3 Paragraph Property

Paragraph property analysis here means that the writer describes how the links between paragraphs in the text and describes the unity of subject of the story in each paragraph. The unity of subject of the story in each paragraph means that the student tells about an event or situation in each paragraph completely and how the student conveys the event or situation in each paragraph. Now the writer describes the narrative text of a bilingual student.

**Bawang Merah Bawang Putih (Bilingual)**

Bawang Putih lived with her stepmother and her stepsister, Bawang Merah. Bawang Putih’s mother died when she was a baby. Her father remarried another woman and later her stepsister was born. Unfortunately, not long after that her father died. Since, then, Bawang Putih’s life was sad. Her stepmother and her stepsister treated Bawang Putih badly and always asked her to do all household chores.

One morning, Bawang Putih was washing some clothes in a river. Accidentally, her mother’s clothes were washed away by the river. She was worried so she walked along the riverside to find the clothes. Finally, she met an old woman. She said that she kept the clothes and would give them back to Bawang Putih if she helped the old woman do the household chores. Bawang Putih helped her happily. After everything was finished, the old woman returned the clothes. She also gave Bawang Putih a gift. The old woman had two pumpkins, one pumpkin was small and the other one was big. Bawang Putih had to choose one.

Bawang Putih was not a greedy girl. So she took the small one. After thanking the old woman, Bawang Putih then went home. When she arrived home, her step mother and Bawang Merah were angry. They had been waiting for her all day long. Bawang Putih then told about the clothes, the old woman, and the pumpkin. Her mother was really angry so she grabbed the pumpkin and smashed it to the floor. Suddenly they all were surprised. Inside the pumpkin they found jewelry. “Bawang Merah, hurry up. Got to the river and throw my clothes into the water. After that, find the old woman. Remember, you have to take the big pumpkin” the step mother asked Bawang Merah to do exactly the same as Bawang Putih’s experience. Bawang Merah immediately went to the river. She threw the clothes and pretended to search them. Not long after that, she met the old woman. Again she asked Bawang Merah to do household chores. She refused and asked the old woman to give her a big pumpkin. The old woman then gave her the big one. Bawang Merah was so happy. She ran very fast. When she arrived home, her mother was impatient. She directly smashed the pumpkin to the floor. They were screaming. There were a lot of snakes inside the pumpkin! They were really scared. They were afraid the snakes would bite them. “Mom, I think God just punished us. We had done bad things to Bawang Putih. And God didn’t like that. We have to apologize to Bawang Putih,” said Bawang Merah.

Finally both of them realized their mistakes. They apologized and Bawang Putih forgave them. Now the family is not poor anymore. Bawang Putih decided to sell all the jewelries and used the money for their daily lives.

In the text above, the writer found that the student has the text in long sentences in each paragraph and the text consists of quite long paragraph. Besides, transition and links between paragraphs strengthen the text and are appropriate. The text above is included in very good category. Actually, in the paragraph property, the analysis is not too complicated, because based on the theory the analysis about this property is short.
In the first paragraph, the student introduces the characters in the story, the early events in the story, and the relationship between characters in the story. The introduction of the story is conveyed completely by the student, so that the reader can understand the story easily. The student introduces the story, firstly by mentioning the main characters, Bawang Putih and Bawang Merah. After that, the student introduces the first event in the story and the relationship between characters in the story. According to the theory, the student completes the subject unity in individual paragraph.

Moving on to the second paragraph, the student tells about the activities that the main characters. Furthermore, in the middle of the main characters’ activities, there was an accident, including the solution of the accident. In the paragraph, the student also introduces a new character of the story. In the third paragraph, the student still continues some events related to the second paragraph and tells other events of the story. In the third paragraph, the student completely tells the main and important events of the story, Bawang Merah and bawang Putih. In the last paragraph, the student concludes the story and shows the new relationship between characters.

From the text above, besides the subject unity in individual paragraph told completely, it also quite perfect and clear. Then, transitions and links between paragraphs strengthen the text and are appropriate. Therefore, the writer concludes that the text above is includes in very good category. Below is the example of narrative text produced by non-bilingual student. Different from bilingual students’ text, there are some non-bilingual students’ text that sometimes in each individual paragraph, the unity subject does not complete and less perfect. Furthermore, the differences were seen in the transitions and links between paragraphs. For example:

3.4 Expression Property

The expression property here means that the writer analyzed the use of style and expressions in narrative text.

Bawang Merah Bawang Putih (Bilingual)

Orientation: Bawang Putih lived with her stepmother and her stepsister, Bawang Merah. Bawang Putih’s mother died when she was a baby. Her father remarried another woman and she later had a stepsister. Bawang Putih always did all the housework by herself, her stepsister and step mother didn’t want to do housework by themselves and they always spend bawang Putih’s Father money.

Complication: One day bawang Putih washed her stepsister and stepmother clothes, but her stepmother clothes float away in the river. Bawang Putih went home and her stepmother was very angry.

Resolution: After that Bawang Putih walked beside the river until found a little house. She knocked that house, an old woman came out. Bawang Putih asked “Have you found some clothes in the river?”. The old woman said “Yes, I’ve founded your clothes, but you must clean my house and I will turn back your clothes.”. So Bawang Putih accepted the old woman and started clean her house, after finished, the old woman turned back the clothes and let Bawang Putih choose two pumpkins, a pumpkin small and the other one very big. Bawang Putih choosed the small one and went home.

Continue of the story: Her mother very happy, because her clothes turned back and Bawang Putih gave that pumpkin to her stepmother. Her stepmother was very surprised and her stepmother went to old woman house, same like Bawang putih, her stepmother cleaned the old woman house and because she was very greedy, so she choosed the big one. After went home, she opened the pumpkin, but there were no gold, but there was a lot bats came out from the pumpkin and killed bawang putih’s stepsister and stepmother.
In the story above, we can see that the narration of events conforms to the type and style of expression in narrative text such as generic structures and features of narrative texts. The emotions are also conveyed realistically particularly in the part of complication. It can be seen from the way the student describes how Bawang Putih was afraid and worried about her stepmother’s clothes, which made Bawang Putih strained to find her stepmother’s clothes. Moreover, in the resolution, the student expresses a good solution in detail. Furthermore, the student arranges the topic of the story logically and presents it consistently with the purpose of the story. Therefore, the writer concludes that the expression used in narrative text belongs to good category.

Next, the writer describes and explains the narrative text of non-bilingual students. Actually, not all non-bilingual students’ are confused in the use of expression in narrative text, but only some of them are. It can be seen from the following example:

Cinderella (Non-Bilingual)

Once upon a time, there was a girl called Cinderella. Cinderella lived happily with her mother and father until her mother died. Feel that Cinderella needed a mother figure in her life, Cinderella’s father remarried to a widow with two daughters. After her father married, Cinderella look like not happy with her stepmother. Cinderella’s sisters always hate Cinderella. After Cinderella’s father died, Cinderella is so bad. The step mother and sisters where conceited and bad tempered. They treated Cinderella very badly. The stepmother made Cinderella do the hardest works in the house, such as scrubbing the floor, cleaning the pot, and pan and preparing the food for the family. The two stepsisters on the other hand, did not work about the house. Their mother gave them many handsome dresses to was going to give at the palace. They were excited about his and spend so much time choosing the dresses they would wear. Cinderella cry, "why are crying Cinderella? “a voice asked, she look up and saw"

In the example above, we can see that the text written by non-bilingual student is difficult to understand, because there is no complete narrative of events that conforms to the type and style of narrative expression. We can see that the story does not have complete generic structures such as orientation, complication, and resolution. The student only conveys the orientation of the story, but in the rest there is no complication and resolution. Moreover, the arrangement of the topic to the entire story is not logical and less consistent with the purpose of the story. The student also does not convey the emotion clearly in the story. Sometimes, the student does not give the emotions in the story. Thus, the writer concludes that the text is included in poor category.

In this study, the differences of the writing products in narrative text between bilingual and non-bilingual classes at SMP Negeri 4 Surabaya could be related to the process of teaching writing in English in the classes. Using the theory proposed by Seow (2002, pp.316-318), the writer found that there were differences in the process of teaching writing between bilingual and non-bilingual. In the bilingual class, the teacher completed the four stages in the process of teaching English writing appropriate with the theory, while in the non-bilingual one, the teacher only completed two stages in the process of teaching writing from the theory. Therefore, this probably influences the writing product qualities between two classes.

Conclusion

Based on the analysis the writer found that most of the narrative texts produced by bilingual students can be said to belong to the category of average to good range in each part of language and expression properties. On the other hand, the narrative texts produced by non-bilingual students tend to belong to the category of poor to average almost in each part of language and expression properties. The differences in the qualities of writing products between two classes are in the use of simple past tense verbs in narrative text, use of vocabulary, and sentence structures and orders. Furthermore, according to the her observation, the writer found that there were differences in the process of teaching English writing between bilingual and non-bilingual classes. In this study, the writer sees the different processes of teaching writing conducted by the teacher in class influence the ability of the students to produce narrative texts.
References